

# **Alstom Protest Hearing for UTDC Light Rail Vehicle Refurbishment**

**June 11, 2012**

**Agenda Item 11**

## Procurement Process

The procurement method selected for this project is a “Best Value” procurement, which means a competitive, negotiated procurement process in which RT reserves the right to select the most advantageous offer by evaluating and comparing factors in addition to cost or price, such that a public agency may acquire technical superiority even if it must pay a premium price.

Acquisition Processes and Techniques, as set out in the Federal Acquisition Regulations, are:

1. **Tradeoff process**
  - This process permits tradeoffs among cost or price and non-cost factors and allows the Government to accept other than the lowest priced proposal.
  - The perceived benefits of the higher priced proposal should merit the additional cost.
2. **Lowest price technically acceptable source selection process**
  - Solicitations shall specify that award will be made on the basis of the lowest evaluated price of proposals meeting or exceeding the acceptability standards for non-cost factors.
  - Trade-offs are not permitted.
  - Proposals are evaluated for acceptability but not ranked using the non-cost/price factors.

Due to the technical complexity of this project, the number of unknowns in the technical requirements, and the desire to have the most highly-qualified project staff to manage those “unknowns,” RT selected the Tradeoff process and established evaluation factors designed to ensure RT received the “best value”.

# RFP EVALUATION CRITERIA

<b>The Firm</b>	
<b>Experience &amp; Financial Capacity</b>	<b>5 pts</b>
<b>Subsystem Suppliers</b>	
<b>Supplier Experience &amp; Manufacturing Capability</b>	<b>5 pts</b>
<b>Referenced Projects:</b>	<b>3 pts</b>
<b>Staffing Plan and Resumes</b>	<b>6 pts</b>
<b>Project Manager</b>	<b>6 pts</b>
<b>Approach to Accomplish the Work</b>	<b>9 pts</b>
<b>Quality Control</b>	<b>5 pts</b>
<b>Compliance with Technical Specifications</b>	<b>8 pts</b>
<b>Relevant Design and Manufacturing of Subsystems –</b>	
<b>Auxiliary Power System</b>	<b>3 pts</b>
<b>Communications System</b>	<b>3 pts</b>
<b>Event Recorder System</b>	<b>2 pts</b>
<b>Project Schedule</b>	<b><u>5 pts</u></b>
<b>TOTAL QUALIFICATIONS AND TECHNICAL SCORE:</b>	<b>60 points</b>
<b>Price Proposal</b>	<b><u>40 points</u></b>
<b>TOTAL EVALUATION SCORE:</b>	<b>100 points</b>

## PROJECT MANAGEMENT TEAM

Requirement	Siemens	Alstom
Project Manager	<p>Masters' Electrical Engineering PMP Several LRV projects identified</p> <p>100% of his time is dedicated to the project.</p>	<p>B.A. in Electrical Engineering from American State University 2009-2011 Site Manager of West Coast Operations for Alstom, 2009 PM for maintenance contract for Alstom 1987-2008 Worked at DynCorp. International, last as Director of Shop Maintenance, fair amount of QC experience 30% of his time is dedicated to the project.</p>
Site Manager		<p>Site Manager created to supplement the Project Manager. 100% of time dedicated to the project.</p>
Engineering Project Manager	<p>Master of Business Administration, B.S. With Siemens since 1991 Both new and overhaul experience identified</p>	<p>"TLS Engineering Manager" is named and shown in org chart, but no resume is provided</p>
Electrical Engineering Manager	<p>Degree from University College Dublin 17 years working for Siemens</p>	<p>Degree from DeVry Not clear exactly what he's done since joining Alstom in 2008 No train experience prior to Alstom Works with TLS</p>
Mechanical Engineering Manager	<p>B.S. and M.S. 5 years with Siemens</p>	<p>B.S. and M.S. 4 years with Alstom Lot of project/program manager experience Rail experience starts in 2005</p>
Propulsion Engineer	<p>Masters in Electrical Engineering 10 years rail experience with Indian Railways and G.E.</p>	<p>B.S. from Polytechnical National Institute Been with Alstom since 2003 Works with TLS Worked with Siemens from 1993-2003</p>

# PROJECT MANAGEMENT TEAM

-continued-

<b>Requirement</b>	<b>Siemens</b>	<b>Alstom</b>
Sourcing Specialist/Buyer	13 years with Siemens	B.A. Business 10 years sourcing experience with Alstom Buying experience back to 1984
Commercial Project Manager	B.S., Business Management Financial Manager—works with PM to make sure budget and schedule are met	None identified
Systems Engineer – Communications Systems and Event Recorder	M.S. Electrical Engineering Joined Siemens 2010, Consultant at Bombardier prior to that, BAE before that	None identified
Systems Engineer – HVAC	B.S. Engineering, HVAC certificate; Several new LRV and overhaul references, 12 years experience with Navy HVAC	None identified
Systems Engineer – Reliability, Maintainability, Safety and Human Factors (RMSH)	Masters of Science Electrical Engineering, PM Certificate, PE,	None identified
Director of Enterprise Schedule	MBA, BS Mechanical Engineering, PMP certified 6 years of experience with scheduling at Siemens, Expert in Primavera	None identified
Manufacturing and Production Engineering	B.S. Engineering With Siemens since 1996	None identified
Quality Manager	Interim	None identified
Technical Adviser	Masters Mechanical Engineering Worked with UTDC cars—both procurement and operations 30 years experience with light rail	None identified

## TECHNICAL SPECIFICATIONS COMPARISON

### RT TECHNICAL SPECIFICATION

#### **Plymetal Subfloor Repair**

If the plymetal subfloor is found damaged or deteriorated when the floor covering is removed, Contractor must replace such plymetal subfloor. Partial cutting and replacement of the plymetal subfloor within the unit panel is permitted if the shiplap joints are positioned over structure. Replacement subfloor must have the shiplap joint that matches with the original plymetal panel, and must be properly sealed with fire isolation sealant to avoid flame penetration to interior of the vehicle. Contractor must install the panel with inserts at the bottom of the panel to level the panel with adjacent panels. Contractor is responsible for the replacement cost of plymetal sub-floor.

### SIEMENS RESPONSE

If subfloor panels are found to be damaged or deteriorated during floor covering repair, Siemens will replace the subfloor localized around the affected area. Wherever possible, partial panel replacement would be Siemens' preferred method; however this will only be performed where shiplap joints can be placed over carbody structure. Panel joints and edges will be filled with an appropriate fire sealant.

Any replacement panels or panel sections will be installed with shims to ensure they are flush with the existing subfloor, any panel gaps will be sealed and feathered smooth.

In cases where repairs may be indicated per Section 2.2.8, Sub-section 3:

Ply-metal sub-floor will be repaired if it is found to have cladding and/or wood layer delamination. The affected area will be cleaned, re-laminated and surfaced to produce a flatness of within +/- 2 mm (.08 in) of the average height of the extent of the surrounding 30 cm (11.81 inch) radius.

Ply-metal sub-floor that is found to have strength reduced greater than 15% of original material due to deterioration from "dry rot" or other mechanism will be replaced and height matched to the adjacent area as stated in this section of the RFP.

### ALSTOM RESPONSE

Alstom shall be compliant with the requirements of this section with the full scope of work agreed after coverings have been removed. (sic)

# TECHNICAL SPECIFICATIONS COMPARISON

## RT TECHNICAL SPECIFICATION

Floor Covering and Repair  
As part of the Joint Outgoing Inspection, Contractor must inspect all floor coverings for damage, aging and deterioration. Areas that show lifting or bubbles and that are identified during the Joint Outgoing Inspection must be removed and inspected for the extent of damages to plymetal subfloor. Contractor must replace floor covering at such areas with the same type of floor covering material. If the plymetal sub-floor is damaged, Contractor must replace the damaged plymetal sub-floor with the same type of sub-floor material (ref. Section 2.2.9).

## SIEMENS RESPONSE

Floor covering identified as damaged, aged, deteriorated, lifting, or bubbled during the joint outgoing inspection will be removed and replaced. During the removal and replacement process, the plymetal subfloor panels will be inspected for damage or deterioration.

Siemens' plan for floor restoration:

**Loose Seams:** In areas where the rubber has come loose from the sub-floor at floor rubber seams, but no damage to the rubber itself exists: Raise the rubber back to the point of good adhesion to the sub-floor, remove failed adhesive from the rubber and sub-floor and re-adhere the rubber to the sub-floor with floor rubber OEM adhesive.

**Missing Material:** In cases where floor rubber material is missing more than 1 square centimeter of material, a square of material will be removed that reaches just beyond the area of damage and will be replaced with a piece of like, OEM material in matching color and configuration (smooth or ribbed). In cases where less than 1 square centimeter (.39 in) of material is missing, black sealant will be used to fill in the area. The objective being to make patches as small and invisible as possible

**Subfloor Ridges:** In areas where a ridge in the sub-floor exists NOT at a rubber seam, the conclusion is that the rubber has come loose from the sub-floor at sub-floor seams (as evidenced by the ridge in the floor rubber): Create a slit through the rubber the length of the ridge and pull back floor rubber to expose the sub-floor area without tearing the floor rubber. Determine the cause of the ridge and clean out/repair as required (see also 2.2.9 Plymetal Subfloor Repair), then re-adhere the rubber to the sub-floor with floor rubber manufacturer recommended adhesive, applying weight until cured. Ridges in ribbed walkway areas less than 5 mm (.20 in) high (when compared to the average level of the flooring greater than 5 cm (1.97 in) perpendicular to the ridge) will be left as-is.

Ridges in smooth seating areas less than 9 mm (.35 in) high (when compared to the average level of the flooring greater than 5 cm (1.97 in) perpendicular to the ridge) will be left as-is.

Finished height of repaired subfloor ridge (including rubber and adhesive thickness) will be +/- 2 mm (.08 in) when compared to the average level of the flooring greater than 5 cm (1.97 in) perpendicular to the ridge.

The rubber of the lower steps in the eight doorways will be removed and replaced with new black ribbed and yellow nose rubber. Holes from the mounting of the step risers will be filled in the base material prior to installation of the new step rubber. Edges of new rubber will be sealed at abutment to the stepwell walls.

Any floor covering removed will be replaced with the same type and color as the rest of the vehicle.

## ALSTOMS RESPONSE

Alstom shall be compliant with the requirements of this section the full scope of work to be agreed at the inbound inspection. (sic)